

that of notorious Smith who married seven times seven women with more or less money attached to them and buried one wife after another for the sake of that money after killing them. I would be the last man to say that such a pre-meditated mercenary like that should escape the death penalty so as to facilitate the doing of other notorious acts. It is perhaps the extreme case. That is a recorded case. The man is called Peace. That man married no less than seven women. He had a good personality. Eventually he went too far, and when he was on the scaffold, he confessed that he had murdered and buried seven wives. There are cases, on the other hand, where a man strikes a blow on the spur of the moment and the man is accidentally killed. It is very easy to prove whether one is killed by accident or not. If the Judge is a very liberal person, it may be technically a serious one, but the Judge can, under some mitigating circumstances, have the option.

Mr. T. M. Krishna Menon.—With considerable difficulty.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Our learned Judges in the Chief Court have been doing that for a long time. It may be for want of nerve or for want of anything else. It may be due to humanitarian reasons. But, so long as there is the superstition that the ghost of the man is likely to haunt the houses of the Judges, there is no fear of the Judges carrying it too far so that that itself is a safeguard.

So that, what I say is, where there is no rigorous law enjoining the Judges to sentence a man to be hanged in cases of murder being proved, the harshness of the thing does not exist. If, as a matter of fact, as the mover said, for 20 years the result in Cochin shows only one case of hanging, whereas, I am sure, there must have been at least 75 or 100 convictions of murder, after all, very much cannot be said against the system which results in very very poor results. On the other hand, let us go and consider the state of affairs in countries where this has been abolished.

Mr. T. K. Nayar.—It is 3-30, Sir.

Adjournment motion re: Management of the Leper Asylum.

Deputy President.—We shall take up the adjournment motion.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, I gave this adjournment motion to call the attention of this House and to raise a discussion on the projected or contemplated transfer of the Leper Asylum to a private body of men. I fully feel conscious that the President has given a very liberal interpretation of the rule, for, by a

narrow interpretation, he could certainly have prevented me from opening this question this evening. As he suggested, and as I anticipated, the object of this motion is not to censure anybody, but to call the attention and to ascertain the views of this House whether this new departure of handing over Government property, Government institutions, to private agencies is conducive to public policy and public peace. There is another reason also, that we are desirous of establishing a convention in this House that, where the Government want to transfer such property, Government shall ascertain our views, the views of the people, of the representatives of the people, before they do these things secretly and without any information whatsoever to the public. These two reasons have prompted me to table this motion, and, as I said, I am very much indebted to the President for giving a generous interpretation of this rule, and we, on our part, shall hope to reciprocate the feeling of the other side.

Well, Sir, what could have been the reasons that prompted the Government in handing over this institution? To my mind, there may be three or four reasons. One is, Government, after due consideration, came to the conclusion that transferring this institution to a private agency would be conducive to the better management of that institution than by the Government itself. If you accept that interpretation of mine, you will be exposing to very severe cross criticisms in this House for you are exposing your weakness or inability. That you are not expected to do. On the other hand, if you advance that it is to the interests of the lepers themselves, the poor patients who are confined in that institution, I, on my part, shall be the last person to criticise the Government's action. (*Hear, hear.*) But it is your duty to prove why, if a private institution could give adequate and proper treatment to the lepers, it could not be done by your highly paid and largely manned Medical Department. We want the explanation for that. I hope the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, when he gets up to answer, will kindly note these points and answer, and, as I said, he must convince me. If so, I shall be the first to support. The second point is, it maybe a question of professional convenience. As you are all aware, Leper Asylum does not give much scope or material for private practice. It is a very inconvenient institution for people have to come in contact with infectious disease, and it may be that medical men may not like to meet such cases. I am authorised by the members in the medical profession, from whom I got this information of the contemplated transfer, to enter their emphatic protest against any such interpretation. They wanted to make it clear to this House and

through this House to the public that it was not at their motion that this contemplated project was undertaken. They wanted you to understand that it was the intention of men of their profession, irrespective of the nature of the case, to undertake all such cases, and they wanted you to understand that they were ready to do their level best for these poor people.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Who are they?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I won't tell you the names of your subordinates.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is not names that I want.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Your subordinate officers, a number of medical men. I know the names. But I won't give them to you. That is the second point I wish to emphasise. I go a step further. If the medical men themselves complain that they do not like these things, the only course they have is to tender their resignation and get out of service. Any medical man, who does not like to handle a case on account of nastiness or for fear of infection, is unfit to be in that profession. Therefore, that consideration should not weigh with any Member in this House in coming to a decision. Then you may say about the economic cause. I refuse to discuss that point at all. The first item of expenditure of the Government should be to provide reasonable comfort and good nourishment to this most unfortunate victims of leprosy. I say I refuse to discuss the economic side of the question. Then the fourth possible thing is that the Government, all on a sudden, developed a desire that our people should be taught to handle these various institutions. Is it so? In connection with the non-official committee, the duty of the medical profession is only to make a general supervision and to report any shortcomings to the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer. They need not take charge of any hospital. That was promised in the Bill.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Which Bill was that?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Old Bill. If any honorary Member seeks legislation for a scheme in which the Government has to supply all the funds, it is required to stand aloof, while a body of governors runs to show that Government may be asked to farm out in this manner.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Farm out?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Beg your pardon. To have a party of governors! He becomes sarcastic.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—This is a novel invention of Government.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Not novel invention of Government. Novel invention of Government medicine. Then I said you have become very sarcastic, very jolly. Now, as I said, that was the view of the Hon'ble Member three years ago. But I remember the expression that it is not here now. But is any institution run by Government money, to be modelled by the public? Then I ask the question which we can choose. Invade into our reserve? Through no stretch of imagination whatsoever could I think that it was a great desire to teach our people to manage public institutions that prompted the learned Doctor to press the Government to hand over these institutions to a private body. Now, Sir, may I ask what is the objection in handing over other institutions also to private bodies? My friend, Mr. Raman, said the other day, may be joking, that he has no objection to take the Excise Department. He will run it.

What is the objection given to each one of these by you when we say that we will run all these? Then there is at least some consolation that we happen to be born in this country. You have given the reasons that they belong to the indigenous population of Cochin State. I say the proposition is so absurd to hand over Government property without the wishes of the people. I maintain, in spite of the assurances to the contrary, you have no more right to hand over our property without the wishes of the non-official Members of this House. (*Hear, hear.*) I refuse to concede to that point that, because you are appointed, you can deal with the property of the people, with the national institutions, as you like and as you choose. I object to that tendency, and I enter my emphatic protest against any such proposals. Now we shall consider what are the possible courses. There are 3 ways of managing this. Either it should be managed by the Government; managed by the Government means not in the way in which it is managed now. I do not throw any blame upon the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer for it. Any doctor who is sent to the Leper Asylum considers it as a punishment as those who are being sent to Kuriarkutty or any other unhealthy place. Nobody seems to take any interest in this institution. As I told you in the case of the Lunatic Asylum, you must have a very competent man, you must make him study this subject as thoroughly as possible, he must be made to undertake training in one of the best Leper Asylums and he must be amply paid with free quarters and good salary. So much so, he may come to take an interest in the duties entrusted with him. Now, one man is posted there for 6 months and then another, and so on. Hence, from your tacit admission, it is quite clear that this institution is not properly managed. And, therefore, the next question that arises is how to manage

it properly without handing it over to somebody. Manage it yourselves properly and appoint, as I said, competent men, educated men, who take an interest. If you do that, it will be the best solution of the question. Supposing you cannot do that, or you do not wish to do that, then the next alternative will be to invite agencies and associations locally or local body or people belonging to the Cochin State who are willing to undertake this work. If you cannot do that, hand over this institution after confessing your failure. If you cannot do either of these things, then and then only can you hand over this institution to foreign agency. These, then, are the 3 solutions, and it is for the Government to decide, and after you decide, we may have a chance to say something upon that solution.

Now, Sir, I do not want to go further into this matter because the President said this morning that it was only a contemplated move and actually it has not taken place, and as I said before, it is to warn the Government that this move is fraught with adverse criticism, and I wanted also the Government to realise that this should be reconsidered and wanted to point out and if possible, to induce the Government to adopt proper measures by which the Leper Asylum could be properly managed. Let everybody seated on the other side understand that those days, when things were managed by one or two individuals, are gone and that they cannot do what they like with the properties of the State, no matter how influential, how eminent that man may be. This sort of back-stair arrangements cannot now be had in dealing with the properties of the State. I have urged 4 reasons to commend this motion for the acceptance of the House, and Members of this House will understand the reasons and will give adequate support to discard the contemplated move without consulting us to which we are entitled by our position as Members of the House and as representatives of the people. With these few words, I move this adjournment motion.

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—I beg to second the motion.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Is there any necessity for seconding an adjournment motion?

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—With regard to the Leper Asylum I endorse every word that was spoken by the mover of the motion. May I know which that particular body is to which the Government intends to hand over charge of the Leper Asylum?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The Salvation Army.

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—I do not know whether any other body than the Salvation Army has approached the Government with a request for that purpose. At any rate, so far as the institution in question is concerned, as the Member for Trichur

said, the Government ought to try its best to see if it can itself manage the institution. The lepers are not to be treated as outcastes, to be handed over to foreign institutions and to be left to their mercy. If the Government does not find it possible to manage it themselves certainly, there will be local institutions, institutions which have local interest, ready and willing to take up the management. I know that there are well established local institutions, which would take up the work most willingly.

Mr. C. A. Kunjuni Raja.—Who are they?

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—There are local institutions such as Archdioceses of Ernakulam and Verapoly. Simply to hand it over to foreign agencies in utter disregard of local institutions is not a wise method of doing things at all. As regards the Salvation Army I think this is not the first move of the kind. So far as the Poor House at Ernakulam is concerned, I know, as a matter of fact, that local institutions have made their offers to take up its management. In spite of that, there is the fear ...

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Do you mention any particular institution?

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—The Archbishops of Ernakulam and Verapoly have written to the authorities that they are willing to take up its management.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The offer has been accepted by the Poor House Committee.

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—So far as I know, it has not been accepted. The Salvation Army is still trying to get in through the backdoor.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—To get hold of this?

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Is there any institution which will take it up?

Mr. V. D. Ouseph.—So far as the Leper Asylum is concerned, there was no notification published inviting those who would take up its management. But in the case of the Poor House a notification was published by the Chairman calling for offers for its management, and I know that both Ernakulam and Verapoly Archbishops have offered to accept management. It is not my point that the Leper Asylum ought to be given to either of these two. The Government should try to do it itself first. If it is not possible for Government to do so, then, give it to some recognised local institution which has got a standing here. The Salvation Army has absolutely no stake in the State. With these words I commend this motion for the acceptance of the House.

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—May I know how this matter stands at present? I want some information.

Deputy President.—The President has already said that.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Sir, I need not recount here the history of the establishment of the Leper Asylum at Adoor because the antecedents of that event are already vivid to this House by the hammerings which have been given to it by the Hon'ble Member for Jews on more occasions than one. Now, leaving the preliminary stage of the circumstances under which the new Leper Asylum has been constructed in Adoor, I have to proceed to say at once that the colony is designed to accommodate 200 inmates—120 males and 80 females. The main buildings have been finished and the subsidiary buildings connected with the Asylum are also in course of completion.

And then the question arose as regards the future management of the Asylum.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Who mooted that scheme?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The matter at issue was whether it must be continued entirely under the Government management on up-to-date lines on which Leper Asylums are managed in the present day or handed over to any agency possessing the necessary trained personnel at their command and adequate experience in the management of similar institutions. The recent policy of the British Government is, since the last 15 or 20 years, after the experience of managing Lazarettos under their control, to utilise private agencies for the management of Leper Asylums in India in the present day. The management of Leper Asylums by Government agency has been found to be a thorough failure so far as the benefit to the lepers and control of the leprosy question in India are concerned. A very influential philanthropic body in England called the Leper Mission to the East moved the conscience of the Indian Government that the then condition of Leper Asylums as run by British Government was most unsatisfactory. The result of modern research has been such as to inspire confidence in the cure of leprosy and the British Government started very large Asylums in several parts of India and particularly in Northern India under the auspices of this body. There are now under this Leper Mission to the East many Asylums, some of these having about 700 to 1,200 inmates in different places.

The Leper Asylum in Madras, which was in the heart of the town in olden days, was condemned, and in Chingelpet a large Asylum accommodating more than 1,200 inmates was constructed by Government and handed over to the Scottish Mission which has been working in Chingelpet in the Madras Presidency. Our Asylum at Adoor is designed almost on the same line as the Chingelpet Asylum, and the reason why Government management of a Leper Asylum has been a failure is simply because, in dealing with a disease like leprosy, sympathy

and self-sacrifice must be brought into play. This disease is well known to be infectious, and the fate of two medical officers who were in charge of the Leper Asylum was that they died eventually of leprosy. Their case was sufficient warning to the men in Government service to-day to work in a Leper Asylum. I would also refer to several well-known authorities who say that service in a Leper Asylum is risky and Government men are most unwilling and reluctant to do that work. History also shows how Fr. Damien who went into a leper Colony contracted the disease and died of it, so that there is sufficient knowledge that this disease is attended with risk. And Government management in a matter like that would be lacking in that self-sacrifice which is so essential. Now the Salvation Army are specialists in this branch of social service of managing Leper Asylums, and that is a body which has a Medical mission as a part and parcel of the various philanthropic duties under its management apart from the religious work itself. The Salvation Army in recent times has concentrated on social work and their services have been requisitioned by the British Government in various social works, such as in the reclamation of the Kallars in the Tinnevely District and reclamation of hill tribes in Central India besides management of Leper Asylums. In all these places the services of the Salvation Army have been requisitioned by the Government to do work which Government was unable to do with that amount of success which is so essential in a work of that kind. Here also there are difficulties and every one knows them. Shall I quote instances?

An outbreak of small-pox in Venduruthi Leper Asylum took place. As soon as 3 or 4 were affected with small-pox, I sent for the vaccinator of this division and gave him orders to go there and vaccinate and protect the other inmates. The next morning he came to my office and laid down his instruments at my feet and said "I can't go there, Sir. I would rather resign because I am not going to risk my life."

Then another instance. I wanted a few of the lepers in the Venduruthy Asylum who were undergoing some special treatment to be brought for my inspection once a week. I expected the patients on a particular day and the patients were not brought to my office by the man in charge. I asked him why? He said there was no boat in which he could bring them—5 or 6 men with him. I asked him why he could not take them in his own boat. He said "Oh! I cannot take these lepers in my boat."

And then all these various difficulties and the experiences, as I said, of the British Government in the management of

Leper Asylums gave me the rooted impression that the management of our Leper Asylum, for which we had expended very nearly a lakh of rupees—or somewhat near that—, selected a beautiful site of 100 acres in extent, built very beautiful buildings, made provisions so that accommodation may be on most up-to-date lines, if continued by Government, would be soulless and there would be no benefit at all. This leper question is now exercising the public mind everywhere, and it is assuming such dimensions as to arouse the interest of the Government to-day to carry on leprosy service. The principal factors that weighed with me in deciding upon a private agency was a desire to do the very best for the lepers. And I knew that, situated in that sequestered part, such as Adur is, far away from all possible chances of close supervision by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, the medical man there will have his own way, and unless you have a man who is really devoted to that work and willing to take risk for the sake of that work, it will be of little use. (*Hear, hear.*) And then, again, if it continues to be a part and parcel of the Medical Department, the man in charge may have to be transferred, and in the interests of lepers, I thought it would be much better to entrust the work to some responsible persons who would take it and carry on the work permanently and then the result of the work would materially benefit not only the patients there but also attract cases that are in the neighbouring villages where leprosy is supposed to prevail.

The Salvation Army now has a medical establishment in Travancore. They have got a large staff of doctors and trained nurses and in negotiating with them I found that in point of economy we stood to gain as the Member wanted to know whether we stood to lose or to gain.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Are they paid doctors?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—They are social workers and they get their maintenance only.

In my preliminary negotiations with the Salvation Army I have learned that they would accept the management of our Adur Leper Asylum on the same terms as we are managing it in Venduruthy now. As the mover of the motion has said, the fate of the lepers in the Venduruthy Leper Asylum is very sad indeed. It is not that which the Government wanted. Government wanted to put them in the most comfortable and on the most up-to-date line of treatment. (*Hear, hear.*) To carry on the work in that line we have to get a staff of doctors and nurses of which I have got here a list which is the irreducible minimum that would be necessary if Government were to manage the institution at Adur. As a matter of fact, now I may say there is no permanent medical officer in charge of Venduruthy

Leper Asylum. One goes from the General Hospital. No compounder, no nurses, no ward servants to look after the lepers, except a few servants.

Statement of additional expenditure consequent on Government management of the Leper Asylum at Adur.

	Rs.		Rs.
Medical Officer	250	1 Gate-keeper	12
Allowance including compensation for loss of practice	100	2 Peons	24
Assistant Medical Officer	100	2 Gardeners	24
Allowance to do	50	3 Cooks	36
Store-keeper	30	2 Warders	24
Clerk	30	2 Male ward attendants	24
Matron	60	1 Female ward attendant	12
5 Nurses	150	18 Leper menials, such as ward coolies, toties, dhobies, etc.	72
1 Compounder	30		
			228
Hospital.			
1 Surgery cooly	12		
1 Male ward attendant	12		
1 Female ward attendant	12		
1 Male toty	12		
1 Female toty	12		
	860		

Grant total Rs. 1,088 or say Rs. 13,000 per annum.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—On a previous occasion you said that doctors in the General Hospital do not get anything by way of private practice.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—That is all imagination.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I pointed out that there were persons who were getting Rs. 400 and more. "We do not make anything", that is what you said.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is all fiction. -I have never said anything of the kind at any time. I might have differed about the exaggerated amounts stated by the Member.

The present arrangement with the Salvation Army is only to give this Rs. 12 and they have to meet the balance out of their own funds. I will tell how it came to happen. The Salvation Army was going to establish a Leper Asylum of their own on the border of our own State not far away from Puthenkuzhu. By an accident I came to know of that fact, and then I asked them about this. At that time I was in correspondence with the Leper Mission to the East at Calcutta to take up this exactly on the same terms on which they were doing it in Central Provinces, etc. In the course of that conversation I learned that the Salvation Army was going to spend some money on leprosy work and then I asked them to join in an

[with us and deal with it in a more successful way. I would only persuade our Government to give them the amount that we are spending at Venduruthy. The Madras Government is contributing all the expenditure at the Chingelpet Leper Asylum to the Scottish Mission.

The following is the agreement between the Madras Government and the Scottish Mission for the management of the Chingelpet Asylum:—

Chingelpet Leper Asylum.

Government Contribution.

1. Medical Officer	...	Rs 575 per mensem
European Matron	..	Rs. 375
European Nurse	...	Rs. 325
2. P. and O. Passage, II class for		
i. Doctor and wife		
ii. Matron		
iii. Nurse		
Outfit for		
i. Doctor		£ 70
ii. Matron		£ 70
iii. Nurse		£ 70
3. Subordinate medical,		
nursing, clerical-		
staff per annum	..	Rs. 7,710
Menial staff do	...	Rs. 4,860

Though we may not have to spend at this scale, an additional sum of Rs. 13,000 annually is the irreducible expenditure that would have to be spent in case this institution is to be continued directly under Government management. This sum would be a saving to us under the proposal to transfer it to the management of the Salvation Army because they were contributing the necessary men and money and all we had to do was to pay what we are spending at Venduruthy now.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—There is no use of comparing our State with the Government of Madras.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Whatever may be the expenses we are not concerned with the question of economy.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I should now enlighten the House on the local agency available to take up the management.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The Hon'ble Member has exceeded the time. I request the President to enforce the rule.

Deputy President.—I shall give him 5 minutes more.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—On a point of order. As I said before, we are not going to discuss the economic side of the question. I told you plainly that it would be an expensive one. The Government must bear the expenses. I have given you certain points. Please answer to them.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—But I am enlightening the House regarding all relevant points.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—But there is a time limit. 40 minutes have been taken. I request the President for a ruling.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I think I have made clear. It is a point of economic gain. Only a recurring expenditure of 13,000 rupees will have to be met. It is a gain to the Government. The Salvation Army is bringing their own European Nurses, their own European servants and the whole staff is going to be paid by them. Add to that that element of self-sacrifice which the Government cannot provide because it is an abstract thing. It is impossible. The British Government have found it out. The Leper Asylums functioning under Government management have been an entire failure in the past. There is a sentimental repulsion for this work and Government cannot supply that element of self-sacrifice which will be found only among those who have devoted themselves for such unpleasant and risky work. Have I exceeded the time?

One other point the supporter of the motion mentioned. I think I have explained to the House the bare facts that are connected with this proposition. This is an important point which the House should know because that point has not been stressed here, that we could assume the management if we have grounds to do so.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—What is that point?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I want to take a vote. 40 minutes have been taken. I was very carefully noting this.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—There is a rule. The rule is this, that we can talk it out.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I want a ruling from the Chair. We want to do away with this 'talking out.' You are an impartial Chairman and I want an impartial ruling.

Deputy President.—I have already said that I will give him five minutes more.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have got a right of reply.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Only the mover. There is a rule. Anyhow, if the President will kindly allow you, you can exceed your time.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—We have heard enough. Your idea is to talk it out.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, under Rule 21, no speech during the debate shall exceed 15 minutes. The rule is imperative.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We have also the rule for talking it out.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—By each Member speaking for 15 minutes and not by one Member speaking for the whole of an hour or two.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I want the President's ruling.

Deputy President.—I have already given that. I have been telling you that I will give him only 5 minutes more.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—But five minutes are over.

Deputy President.—I cannot allow you to speak further.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, I rise to support the motion before the House, and in doing that, it has to be well understood that the very first question with which this Legislative Council was opened was mine and it was the Leper Asylum question. It is agreed on all places that for this Leper Asylum we have spent more than 3 times the amount required for a Leper Asylum. We started a Leper Asylum at Anappara at a cost of a lakh and 82 thousand and it is said that that Leper Asylum may be converted into a First Grade College. Then you went out seeking for another Leper Asylum at Adoor and we know large amounts have been spent upon that. So no other point need be mooted on the ground that the Cochin Government is not prepared to spend money for Leper Asylum for looking after the lepers. I want in justice to condemn the Government's action in as vehement terms as I possibly can upon the statements now made before this House, that, at the Venduruthy Leper Asylum, where we have spent for the mortar and brick walls and to acquire property, life has been made very miserable for the lepers taken under your care at Venduruthy. Twelve rupees you are spending per head to look after these lepers, and you have provided them with no doctor, no nurse, no compounder, no amenities. Is it with pride that these statements are made here? Was it the non-official body or the Government that was looking after them? Did the Government know or did the Government care to know how they are looked after? Why did the Government stint the expenditure in these matters? Why does the Government show such callous indifference here too, and was it our indifference? The Government go further and say that they have built one building away in Adoor and they will hand it over to a private agency. That is the weakness and the callousness on the part of our Government. You have been trying to create some impressions upon the mind of this House with the instances of the British Government handing over charge to the missionary and all their examples were quoted liberally. They want to favour their own missions, their own country-men, by giving more opening for their non-official bodies. Then, Sir, I say we must have also missionary bodies of our own, if we can bring about that movement in our country. What is the movement at

Chingelpet? The Secretary of State is willing to give big sums to his own peoples' missions. Let us start another mission in our country. You give us money and we can run them for the Government. Certainly, if the officials are unsympathetic and cannot find out sympathetic men in Cochin, we, non-officials, will find out sympathetic men and women to look after these lepers. We shall form societies. What encouragement do you give to societies that we form, and what pay do you give to the nurses who do work in your own hospitals? You give those sisters of charity Rs. 40 and Rs. 60, and what pay do you give to the Indian nurses that also do the same number of hours' work in the hospital? And I know that they are paid Rs. 15. I have got the budget. Fifteen and fourteen rupees for the poor women who work all the same hours as the other ladies.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Not Rs. 15, but Rs. 20.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Double that amount you give in charity. That is the position in which the Cochin Government stands. I am sorry. Why is this colour difference kept up in the State in which the Ruler is a coloured man? What is the meaning? We have been spoiling ourselves in this country on account of colour differences that have been clearly shown and exhibited in our land. What is the use to say that Cochin State cannot manage a Leper Asylum and the Cochin people will not find the money necessary for it?

The out-break of small-pox in the Venduruthy Leper Asylum! The vaccinator would not vaccinate. And what ought the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to have done? Dismiss him. What is the function of a superior if his subordinate officers are not doing their duties properly? Dismiss them on the spot.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I converted him.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I am glad that your persuasive methods have succeeded. More repressive measures could have been adopted in these cases. Therefore, Sir, it is our wish that, in our country, after having spent such a lot of money and having built a building at Adoor for the Leper Asylum, it is not advisable to hand over the buildings to the Salvation Army. I do not want to blame that organisation at all. They are prepared to come to Puthenkurusu. After having erected a building costing so much money, they are asked to take charge of those human materials and that is with sympathy.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We have sympathy with them.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You have no sympathy. Therefore, it is, Sir, our desire that the Government should run the Leper

Asylum as a Government concern. Had proper recommendations been placed before the Government, our Government would have liberally sanctioned them.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Are you going to pay the European doctor Rs. 600?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Rs. 250 only.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Pay him 300. Get a good man. There will be Cochinites to take up the post for Rs. 350. You can get a first class Cochinite for Rs. 350. There is no use of discussing the economic side at all in this matter. We have already stated in this House that the economic side need not be taken up in this question. The money that is necessary, this House will liberally grant. How many thousands of money were spent between the 30th of November and the 2nd of December? How much money had been thrown away to enjoy in rockets and in *tamasas*? Can you not give more money for a humanitarian purpose like this? Therefore, that is not the point at all, don't bring economic consideration here. This House is prepared to incur a greater expenditure and will even tax our people, if it becomes necessary to find out money to run our country properly. If the Government is not prepared, there is room for another set of men, and when Responsible Government comes, we may replace them as we desire. With these few words I support the motion.

മിസ്റ്റർ കെ. അയ്യപ്പൻ.—ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെ ഞാൻ എതിർക്കുന്നു. സ്വരാജ്യസ്ഥാനവും മറ്റുമൊത്തു അഭിപ്രായം പറയേണ്ട കാര്യമല്ല ഇതു. ഏതു നയമെടുത്താൽ ഈ രോഗികൾക്കു തല്ലാലസ്യം കിട്ടുമോ ആ നയത്തിന്നു ഈ സഭ ഒരുമിച്ചു വോട്ടു ചെയ്യണമെന്നാണെന്നു അപേക്ഷ. കഷ്ടാശുപത്രിയുടെ ഭരണം എടുക്കാൻ ഈ രാജ്യത്തുതന്നെ വല്ല മാഷ്യൻകാരും ഉണ്ടെങ്കിൽ അവർ കൊടുക്കുന്നതിന്നു വിരോധമില്ല. പക്ഷെ ആർക്കൊടുത്താലും രോഗികളുടെ ആശ്വാസമാർഗ്ഗം പ്രധാനമായി ഭവിക്കേണ്ടതു. പണം ചിലവാക്കിയതുകൊണ്ടു ഈ സംഗതിയിൽ ഏറ്റവും നല്ല ഫലം കിട്ടുകയില്ല. ഏതായാലും ഈ ആതുരശുശ്രൂഷയിൽ വേണം. ഏതായാലും വിലക്കുമേടിക്കുവാൻ കിട്ടുന്നതല്ല. ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു നടത്തിയാൽ ഇതു ശരിയാകയില്ല. ജൂത മെമ്പർ പറയുമ്പോലെയുള്ള ബ്യൂറോ ക്രസിയൽ ഓരോരുത്തർക്കും സ്വന്തനിലയിൽ മധുരമായ ഏതെങ്കിലും എല്ലാവർക്കുംകൂടി ചേർന്നുള്ള ഒരു ഏജൻസി. ഈ മാതൃക ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു മാറ്റി ഏജൻസിയുള്ള ഒരു ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു വന്നാൽ നമുക്കു ഈ ഭരണം തിരിച്ചെടുത്തു കൊള്ളാമല്ലോ. നമ്മുടെ സ്വരാജ്യവാദവും മറ്റും ചിലവാരേണ്ട സംഗതിയായി ഇതിനെ എടുക്കരുതു. അതൊക്കെ വേറെ സംഗതികളിൽ എടുക്കാം. സമ്പദ്കൊടുത്തു ആളെ നിയമിക്കാമെന്നു പറയുന്നുണ്ടല്ലോ. വലിയ ശമ്പ

ഉം കൊടുത്താൽ വലിയകൊതിയനെയാണു കിട്ടുക. എടുത്തു വരെയല്ല. ഇതിന്നു ഇതിലേക്കുവേണ്ടി ജീവിതം ഉഴിഞ്ഞിട്ടുവരുന്നവേണം. അവതാരകൻ പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ ഇതിൽ രഹസ്യമെന്തെന്നാണു?

ചാവറൻ ബഹുമാന്ദ്യർ ഡാക്ടർ വി. വർഗ്ഗീസ്.—രഹസ്യമൊന്നുമില്ല.

മാസ്റ്റർ കെ. അയ്യപ്പൻ.—എന്നാൽ ഞങ്ങളോടു ചോദിച്ചിട്ടുവായാലോ? എന്നാൽ ഞങ്ങൾ സമ്മതിക്കുമായിരുന്നല്ലോ. (ചിരി.) ഈ സ്ഥാപനം Salvation Army കൂടുന്നെ കൊടുക്കണമെന്നൊരു പറയുന്നില്ല. പക്ഷെ ഈ ഗവണ്മെന്റിനു അതു നന്നായി നടത്തുവാൻ സാധിക്കുകയല്ല. അതുകൊണ്ടു ഞാൻ ഇതിനെ എതിർക്കുന്നു.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—May I request the President that the adjournment motion may be kindly read by him?

You see I am in agreement with 95 per cent of what the mover of the motion said, to wit, his statement that the transfer of Government institutions to private individuals should not be done in secret or in any clandestine manner. I perfectly agree. I again agree with the statement that the interest of the leper is to be the predominant consideration and nothing else. I was very glad to note, although the discussion later on took a very different shape and perhaps a mischievous course, I was glad to note, when the mover of the motion himself said, that, if he could be convinced that it would be to the interests of the lepers themselves that the transfer was made over to a private agency, he would be the first man to welcome it. I am sure that, apart from the turmoil and passion, adjournment motion seems to have lost its purpose. For goodness' sake consider the matter. The parties affected by this are not represented in this House. The party who is affected are the miserable victims who have been victimised by a practically incurable and heinous disease. He deserves all our sympathy, and if we cannot give that we shall try our best to do something in the matter. Let us consider from that point of view and from that point of view only. I do not care for the economic point also. If the State is to do its duty, it should not grudge to spend any amount to save these poor miserable beings from this heinous disease.

Now I am sorry to find that we are going beyond the scope of the adjournment motion itself. I do not think anybody has got any objection specifically towards the Salvation Army people because they are Salvation Army people. Nobody. The real objection seems to be the secrets entrustment of Government institutions to private agencies and secondly doing that in a clandestine manner. These are

the two points raised. Whether they be Salvation Missions or whether they be Missions under the Archbishop of Ernakulam or the Archbishop of Verapoly does not arise here. The questions involved are these two. Whether Government institutions should be entrusted to private individuals and whether this can be done in a clandestine manner. I believe that on the non-official side there can be no two opinions in an important matter like this. The Government could have taken the views of their legislative advisers. We are here to be consulted on matters like this. At any rate, I am very glad that the Diwan gave us this chance of its being discussed. So I do not propose to say anything more on that point.

As regards the transfer of Government institutions to private agencies, take the case of the grant-in-aid schools. You cannot categorically deny that they cannot be entrusted to private agencies wherever they are forthcoming. The bed-rock question is whether it would be advantageous to have the institution transferred to the private agency. That is the question to be considered. Let us not have any extreme heat in this discussion. Now to go to that question, it appears to me that, as at present constituted, it would be a very difficult thing to have an institution satisfactorily managed by the Government, at any rate as at present constituted. I would like to go into details to substantiate my proposition. What I say is this. In the hospitals we find a system of low-paid servants, coolies and others who are very badly paid. They will consider this period as a sort of punishment. They will be looking for the first opportunity to get out of the hospital if they could. Leprosy is a heinous and risky thing to every one. I am an eye-witness to an institution which was run by about 30 or 40 sisters of charity, an institution entirely run for the looking after of the old and the sick. I have seen some of these ladies of even noble families going and looking after them as if these people are the lowest of the low. It is everywhere the case. I am speaking about facts of which I know. So, unless you can say honestly that you have got a set of Government servants who will not seek their self and who will go into looking after the lepers irrespective of the consequences to themselves, you have no right to say that an agency which is capable of looking after them should not be given the management. Then we come to the other question, should it be given to the Salvation Army. I say it should be given to a competent party, if you cannot run it as much as a competent private agency could. Who that private agency is to be has to be decided after a good search. If there is an indigenous institution capable of doing it, by all means do it. If there is an indigenous institution and Government

wants to give it to the Salvation people or any other people or any competent institution outside the State, Government would be very wrong, I agree there. Government should not consider the matter entirely from the national point of view.

This is a matter in which you must first consider what would be the position of the leper. If the Archbishop of Ernakulam or Verapoly or any Jewish Association or Muslim Association can take it up, then give it to them. I have seen missions working. They never came to India to carry money. They came to India for service. If that is so, I cannot understand why this sentiment or passion should arise. I hope that the House will give due consideration to the interests of the leper and then decide rather than be carried away, as the Member for South Ezhuvass stated, by considerations of nationalism at all.

Mr. A. S. Harihara Ayyar.—Sir, I support the motion, and I bring home to the minds of the Members that the very institution, the Leper Asylum, is a foreign notion and not congenial to India because no Indian home refuses abode if any one of its members happens to be a leper. This is quite a foreign institution—and I think my statements are also correct—that English ladies do not suckle their children with breast-milk and in India the contrary is the case, mothers lose their lives in the cause of their children. Even when they are attacked with any sort of disease and the doctor strongly advises to keep her life that the mother ought not to suckle her children, they do it. Such is the condition in India. So it cannot be said that Indians would not be able to manage the Leper Asylum. All these Indian lepers are also taken to the asylum against their sentiment and it is pitiable on the part of the Government to say that they spend only Rs. 12 per capita. A civil prisoner in civil case gets Rs. 15 per mensem. I do not know what a criminal prisoner gets. So the amount should be increased and the management should be by the Government and never entrust to a foreign institution.

മിസ്റ്റർ ടി. കെ. നായർ.—സർ, ഗവണ്മെന്റിൽനിന്നു ഈ സ്ഥാപനം Salvation Army ക്ക് ഏല്പിച്ചു കൊടുക്കുന്ന കാര്യത്തിൽ Salvation Army കാരെപ്പറ്റി ഒന്നും പറയാനില്ലെങ്കിലും ഗവണ്മെന്റിൽനിന്നു ഓരോ സ്ഥാപനങ്ങൾ അന്വന്മാരെ ഏല്പിക്കുന്നതിനെപ്പറ്റിയാണ് അല്പം പറയാനുള്ളത്. "ഒരു ശുപാർശ" വേണ്ടതായ കെട്ടിടം നൽകിച്ച് അതിൽ ജോലി എടുക്കുവാൻ തക്ക മനോഹരമായുള്ള ആളുകളെ കിട്ടുന്നില്ല എന്നു പറയുമ്പോൾ ഗവണ്മെന്റുതന്നെ ഇനി രാജ്യഭരണം വല്ലവരേയും ഏല്പിച്ചു കൊടുത്തേക്കുമൊ എന്നു ഭയമാകുന്നു. ഡാക്ടർ പറയുന്നതൊക്കെ ശരിയായതിന്നു മുമ്പോ. അതുകൊണ്ടു ഇവടെ ഈ ജോലിക്കു തക്ക

നായ ആൾ ഇല്ലെന്നുവന്നേക്കാം. ഈ Salvation Army യോടു നമുക്ക് ആവശ്യമുള്ള ആളുകളെ തരാമോ എന്നു ചോദിച്ചോ? അവരോടു ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടിരുന്നാൽ തീർച്ചയായും ഇതലേക്കു വേണ്ടതായ ജോലിക്കാരെ തരുമായിരുന്നു എന്നാണ് എന്റെ വിശ്വാസം. അങ്ങിനെ യാതൊരു ഏർപ്പാടും ചെയ്യാതെ ഈ സ്ഥാപനത്തിൽ ശരിയായ ജോലിചെയ്യുവാൻ ഗവണ്മെന്റ് നോക്കിയിട്ടു ആരേയും കിട്ടിയില്ല എന്നു പറയുന്നതു ശരിയല്ല. Management അമ്പനമാരെ ഏല്പിക്കുന്നതിലാണ് എനിക്ക് ബലമായ ആക്ഷേപം.

ദിവാൻ ബഹദൂർ ഡാക്ടർ വി. വർഗ്ഗീസ്.—നമുക്ക് അതിന്റെ control ഉണ്ട്.

മിസ്റ്റർ ടി. കെ. നായർ.—എന്നാൽ എനിക്ക് world ന്റെ control തന്നെ ഉണ്ട്. അധികാരമൊന്നുമില്ലെന്നുള്ളതു എന്തിനാണിതെക്കെ പറയുന്നു? ആളുകളെ ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടിരുന്നെങ്കിൽ കിട്ടിയേനെ. Salvation Army ക്ക് ഇതു നടത്തുവാൻ തരമില്ലെന്നോ മനോഭാവമില്ലെന്നോ അല്ല പറയുന്നത്. അവരുടെ താണിയെപ്പറ്റി നമുക്കുലോചിക്കേണ്ടതില്ല. വേണ്ടവിധം ജോലിയെടുക്കുവാൻതക്ക ആളുകളെ കൊണ്ടുവന്നു management കയ്യിൽ വെക്കണം. ഇതൊരു വ്യാപാര വിഷയമാക്കരുത്. ഇതുപോലെയുള്ള സ്ഥാപനങ്ങൾ വ്യാപാരവിഷയങ്ങളാക്കിയാൽ എത്ര പണം വേണമെങ്കിലും ഇപ്പോൾ ഉണ്ടാക്കാം. അതുസാരമല്ല. എത്രപണം ചിലവാക്കിയ ഒരു സ്ഥാപനമാണ് ഇത്? മൂല്യവേരൂർ മെമ്പർ motion കൊണ്ടുവന്നില്ലെങ്കിൽ ഞങ്ങളാരും ഇതായി കരുതുന്നില്ലായിരുന്നു. ഇത്ര ഗൗരവമായ സംഗതി ജനങ്ങളെ എല്ലാവരേയും അറിയിക്കേണ്ടതല്ലേ? കൌൺസിൽ മെമ്പർമാരോടു പറയാൻ ലജ്ജയാണെങ്കിൽ ഗസറ്റിൽ പ്രസിദ്ധപ്പെടുത്താമായിരുന്നില്ലേ? ഞങ്ങൾക്കു ചില അധികാരങ്ങളെല്ലാമുണ്ടെന്നു പറഞ്ഞു ഞങ്ങളെ ഇവിടെ ഇരിക്കുവാൻ തരമാക്കിയിട്ടുള്ള ഈ ഗവണ്മെന്റ് ഇത്തരം വിഷയങ്ങളിൽ ഞങ്ങളുടെ അഭിപ്രായം അറിഞ്ഞു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കേണ്ടതല്ലേ? ഏതുവിധമായാലും ഈ ആശുപത്രിയുടെ management ഇങ്ങിനെ അമ്പനമാർ കൊടുത്തുകളയരുതെന്നാണെന്റെ അപേക്ഷ.

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—The only questions that arise for our consideration are, first whether it would be proper to assign the functions of Government to a private body, whatever the functions may be, and secondly if it is possible or if it is proper that any function of the Government could be assigned to a proper body, in what way are we to choose that private body of persons, in other words how that choice has to be made. With respect to the first proposition, my submission is that the functions of the Government are various. In respect

of education we find that several colleges and hospitals have been founded by private people. Under these circumstances, it is quite possible and natural that certain functions of the Government can with propriety be entrusted to private bodies with advantage. We find several instances like that not only in our country but elsewhere. So, there is nothing wrong in saying that a particular function of the Government—I don't say all the functions of the Government—can be transferred to the management of a private body to the advantage of the Government. Now, with respect to the choice of the institution, I (would) say that, as far as possible, we should try to see whether any indigenous institution is prepared to take up the work on hand. Now, we cannot say that we have nobody in our State who is able to make sacrifices. We cannot say that. Has the Government made any advertisement for people to come forward to accept this offer? Now I am quite sanguine that people will come to take up this work. I hope that Government will advertise for offers to take up the Leper Asylum on the same conditions on which it is proposed to be given to the Salvation Army people. If the Government has absolutely no objection to that course, I do not want to support the motion. If the Government has objection, then I certainly endorse the motion before the House.

Mr. P. Krishna Menon.—Sir, in the heat of the discussion let us not forget the real point at issue. The motion relates to the *transfer of the management* of the Leper Asylum. As to who works after the transfer is not at all relevant for our discussion. Therefore, we must confine our attention to the real point at issue. And I say that the case of the poor vaccinator who did not approach the leper patient or of any other menial cooly who will not touch the dead body are certainly not points relevant to the discussion. One or two points I shall refer to. With regard to the transfer of Leper Asylums in British India, may I know whether the Hon'ble Member is aware that there is a Leper Asylum in the Central Provinces entirely managed by the Government of that province? Why not the Cochin Government also try to manage the Adoor Leper Asylum with some people, who are willing to work? It is said that selfless people are available for work in this institution. Why not recruit them? Therefore, you need not say that we have no selfless people. It is a contradiction to say that there are none. Why not extend your invitation to them, just as you extended the invitation to the selfless people who are willing to work without anything? Will they refuse to work if some subsistence allowance is to be given them? Where comes the question of economy there? Where is the 13,000 rupees? With regard to the management, the Government of India has transferred a number of institu-

tions for management to different missions, but here all the management is to be with you. May I invite the attention of this House to a discussion that ensued at the last meeting of the Legislative Council at Madras when Dr. Mallayya raised a point of mismanagement in a certain Asylum?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have read it and Dr. Mallayya was replied.

Mr. P. Krishna Menon.—True. But nobody has heard Mallayya's reply to the answer. Anyhow, there was the question raised and there were the complaints accruing rightly or wrongly. But this is apart from the question. We are confined only to the question of management not for actual work in the institution. If you have the capacity to manage, you would not have thought of transferring it. That is the point you impliedly confess. For the paucity of men to be recruited for that work, you have not tried. If you cannot find men in the State, advertise. Nobody will ever refuse, as I said, to come here and work with a subsistence allowance. What is the difference? Selfless work carried on without remuneration is also selfless work when it is carried on with a subsistence allowance. By all means don't give up management but keep the management in your own hands. You must not allow others to get into your house and rule over you.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Is it completely handed over without Government having any control?

Deputy President.—Not handed over.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—A body of visitors is inspecting it.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We have seen the body of visitors inspecting it. We know what they do.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—There is only just time enough for the Members to answer and for me to make a few observations.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Everybody knows that the Salvation Army is a very worthy mission and they have good knowledge about these things. We want to consider the case of the patient, the poor leper. This matter should be well thought over before arriving at a definite conclusion.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I move for a closure motion.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunnji Raja.—I second it.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—The closure motion has to be put to vote.

Closure motion put and negatived.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—I am very sorry to learn from the Chief Medical Officer that there are no *selfless* men and women in the State in Cochin, who might take up this work instead of foreigners. I have no dispute with regard to the handing over

of the management to private institutions. The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer has already confessed here that the Government servants were not giving kind and sympathetic attention and treatment to the poor leper patients. While I happened to be there once or twice, I have heard complaints of these Government servants even beating the poor patients. I consider that the treatment now afforded to them is far from being desirable. So, in the interests of these poor people, it is best to hand over the management to some private body. And now, when it comes to a question of asking others to come and manage, I am bringing to the notice of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer that there are *selfless* and *sympathetic* men and women within our State itself who would certainly accept this work. The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer may not be aware of the existence of many institutions which conduct in our State, organisations such as Orphanages, Poor Houses, etc. The dioceses of Ernakulam, Verapoly and Trichur are famous for such works. If we can find selfless men and women in our own State to take up the management of these poor people and look after them, I really cannot see why the management should be handed over to aliens. I dare say we can find here men and women with heart and sympathy who would seriously look into the comforts and conveniences of these poor lepers. It is an insult for Cochin people to acknowledge that there is not among them men and women with heart and sympathy, to manage a leper home.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I say, competent men.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—There are *competent* men and women in Cochin who will certainly come forward to take up the management, only if they are invited to do so. Even if it had been let known to them, your idea to hand over the management, as you had done to these Salvation Army people, I believe our own people would have come forward and embraced this opportunity. I, therefore, strongly advocate the Cochin Government to try our own people first, before you try aliens. Sir, with these words I support this motion.

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—Sir, those who are in support of the motion were confusing the issues by adding an 'if'. The word 'if' is generally dangerous. We do not know whether there are any institutions already existing to take up the work. Those who spoke for the motion did not say of any indigenous institution that would come forward and take up the management.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Nobody knew it.

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—I say, therefore, it depends upon a condition. Under the existing conditions you have a very well

recognised institution coming up to undertake the work not with a selfish motive but out of selfless spirit. Now as to the idea of managing the Leper Asylum by the Government, I must say that even in European and foreign countries they are managed by non-official bodies, bodies which are more interested, more lively and more selfless, in undertaking these works. So far as I can understand, Indians generally are not forward enough to undertake such selfless works.

So I ask any one of the Members who supported the motion "is there any well recognised institution in India generally conducted properly by the non-official body of the people; is there any institution which has really taken up this work without any support or without any encouragement by foreign institutions?" I again ask is there any private doctor who has ventured to render services in a Leper Asylum till now in Cochin State?

Dr. A. G. Menon.—After the incident at Kuriarkutti no private doctor will approach any Government institution. I can assure you that no self-respecting man will come.

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—Selfless motives must soar above all the Kuriarkutti and other business. Have these generous men been bold enough to take up this work? I am sure no one in our State has ventured to render all possible help or to render services in a self-sacrificing spirit for the alleviation or the nursing of these poor lepers. And even the mover himself has stated that at present the existing Government is not in a position to render all possible help. That a foreign institution has ventured to take up the work soon is, therefore, a blessing and we people should welcome it. Under these conditions, I am sure it would be worth-while to invite the institution which has already come up for their help before long. I also say in this connection that in the Philippines and other foreign countries most of these asylums are run by the public. In the middle ages there were St. Francis of Azissi, Louis, XI there was St. Benedict who were undertaking this work in selfless spirit. But nowhere in India can you hear of any Leper Asylum even in ancient days.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Perhaps there was no leprosy at all.

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—Now the Philippines is the hot-bed of these lepers. It is on account of certain defects in the climate. Generally people are affected by this appalling disease. There also the Government is not running this institution. There are some 90 institutions established for the protection of these lepers. There American and foreign Missionaries are running such institutions and they are doing very good work, and Father Daniel referred to by the Member for Medicine was also a

foreign Missionary who went all the way and worked and established a very well reputed institution with a good number of inmates.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Even the hospitals are not run by Government in England.

Mr. C. V Kuriyan.—But till now no people have come up. It is not good also to prolong the transfer of management to a selfless institution. It is admitted that they are all suffering. Is it good to prolong the misery of these lepers? With these words I oppose the motion.

മാസ്റ്റർ കെ. ടി. മാത്യു.—ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെപ്പറ്റി സംസാരിക്കുവാൻ തുടങ്ങുമ്പോൾ അതിന്നു അനുചലമായൊ പ്രതികൂലമായൊ സംസാരമുണ്ടെന്നു സംശയിക്കുന്നു. എന്നാൽ ഇന്നത്തെ ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിന്റെ സ്ഥിതി കാണുമ്പോൾ എതിർക്കുകതന്നെയാണു വേണ്ടതെന്നും തോന്നുന്നുണ്ടു. ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിൽനിന്നുതന്നെ കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി നടത്തുകൊണ്ടു പോകണമെന്നാണു പ്രധാനമായ വാദം. ഇന്നത്തെ ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു ജനങ്ങളുടെ ഹിതമനുസരിച്ചു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കുന്നില്ലെന്നു ഈ സഭയിൽ പല അനുഭൂതാത്മകസ്ഥാനങ്ങളും പ്രസ്ഥാപിക്കുകയുണ്ടായിട്ടുണ്ടു. ജനങ്ങളുടെ ഹിതമനുസരിച്ചു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കുന്നില്ലെന്നു മാത്രമല്ല, പൊതുജന ക്ഷേമത്തെ അഗണപ്തമാക്കിയും, പൊതുജനാഭിപ്രായത്തെ ധിക്കരിച്ചുമാണു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കുന്നതു. അങ്ങിനെയിരിക്കെ കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിൽനിന്നുതന്നെ നടത്തുന്നതായാൽ രോഗികൾക്കു അധിക ഗുണമൊന്നും ഉണ്ടാകുന്നതിനായില്ലെന്നു വേണം വിചാരിപ്പാൻ. ഈ സംഗതി നല്ലവണ്ണം മനസ്സിലാക്കിയിട്ടും ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി നടത്തിക്കൊണ്ടു പോകണമെന്നു പറയുന്നതിന്റെ തത്വം എനിക്കു മനസ്സിലാകുന്നില്ല.

സാധാരണ ആസ്സു ത്തികൾ നടത്തുന്നതിന്നു ആവശ്യമുള്ളതിനേക്കാൾ വളരെ അധികം സഹോദര സ്നേഹവും മറ്റും കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി നടത്തുന്നവർക്കു അത്യാവശ്യമാണു. അതിനാൽ ശമ്പളമുത്ത അടിസ്ഥാനപ്പെടുത്തി ജോലിചെയ്യുന്ന. ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു ഡാക്ടർമാരെക്കാൾ, സഹോദരസ്നേഹം മുന്നിട്ടു പ്രവൃത്തിക്കുന്നവരായ ഏതെങ്കിലും സംഘക്കാരെ കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി ഭരണം ഏല്പിക്കുന്നതായിരിക്കും അത്ഭുതമം. ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിൽനിന്നു കഷ്ടാസ്സു ത്തി നടത്തുമ്പോൾ അതിലെ ഗവണ്മെണ്ടു ഡാക്ടർമാർ കഷ്ടരോഗികളെ ശരിയായി നോക്കാത്തപക്ഷം, ഈ നിയമസഭയിൽ ആ സംഗതികൾ കൊണ്ടുവന്നു വാദിച്ചു കാര്യങ്ങൾ ശരിയാക്കാമെന്നു പക്ഷെ ചിലർ മറുപടി പറയുമായിരിക്കാം. ഇവരോടു ഇന്നത്തെ പഞ്ചായത്തായിരിക്കുന്ന പഞ്ചായത്തിന്റെ സ്ഥിതിതന്നെ നോക്കുവാൻ ഞാൻ അപേക്ഷിച്ചുകൊള്ളുന്നു. പഞ്ചായത്തിലെ അഴിമതികളെ എത്ര പ്രാവശ്യം ഈ സഭയിൽ ചൂണ്ടിക്കാണിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടു? എന്നിട്ടു അതിന്റെ സ്ഥിതിയെ അല്ലമെങ്കിലും നന്നാക്കുവാൻ ഈ സഭയ്ക്കു കഴിഞ്ഞു.

മോ? ഈ സഭയ്ക്കുള്ള അധികാരം ഇപ്പോൾ അധികമൊന്നുംതന്നെയല്ല, ഉള്ളതു കുറഞ്ഞുകുറഞ്ഞു വരുന്നു. അങ്ങനെയിരിക്കെ ക്ഷാസ്ത്രീ വളരെ അതുപ്രകാരമായ വാഗ്ദത്തൽ ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിൽ നിന്നു നടത്തുകൊണ്ടു പോകുന്നുണ്ടെന്നു ഈ സഭയ്ക്കു വാഗ്ദത്തമുണ്ടായാലും, അതിനെ നന്നാക്കുവാൻ ഈ സഭയാൽ സാധിക്കുന്നതല്ല. ഈ സഭയ്ക്കു കൂടുതൽ അധികാരങ്ങൾ കിട്ടുന്ന സമയത്തു സാധിക്കുമായിരിക്കാം. അതുവരെയെങ്കിലും ക്ഷാസ്ത്രീയുടെ ഭരണം ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിൽനിന്നും വേണ്ടതെന്നു ഈ സഭാ ഗവണ്മെണ്ടിനോടു അപേക്ഷിക്കണമെന്നാണു എന്റെ അഭിപ്രായം.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—When I opened this discussion I thought the Government would be guided by the advice given by the President in the morning that it would be better to discuss and find out what the inclination of the House was. I regret that the Government Members in a body, disregarding the suggestion given by the President this morning, opposed this motion. I made it very clear that it was not brought with any animosity against the Government but only to establish a certain principle that no public institution shall be handed over to any private agencies, especially in a country of castes and communities. When I wanted to establish such a proposition, I regret to note that the Government Members in a body simply got up and, in defiance of the suggestion of the President, opposed this motion for closure. I cannot conceive of a more irresponsible way of behaving, especially when a Member, with the best of intentions, enunciated a certain principle. I have not said a word against the Salvation Army or any of the institutions. As a matter of fact, I said preference should be given to the indigenous institutions, and I should like to know on what ground the Government got up to oppose this adjournment motion and not to allow the House to come to any decision. Is this the way that the Government should behave to a Member, with the recommendation of the President, who comes and says that this question must be discussed so that he might know the intention of the House so as to guide himself in this matter? I can very well understand that there is a difference of opinion in this matter between the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer and the Diwan.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Not at all.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I know there is. I understand that you are negotiating for the transfer. That is our idea. Now I want only to say another word. To take one case, people sometimes forget themselves, and I was sorry to note the criticisms levelled by the Chief Medical Officer about the incapacity, selfishness and self-seeking nature of his own subordinates. That is what he said.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I never said that.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—You did. Self-seeking, incompetent to run an institution of this kind and because it is necessary for running such institutions that you must be ruled by selflessness and higher sentiments.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—In Government service as a whole.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I want to leave the subordinates alone. Can you imagine a Head of a Department coming and saying in this Hall that "all my subordinates are self-seeking and aggrandising?" They simply want to be in the service for money. I say that it is scandalous to the profession to which you and I belong to come to a public place like this and say that medical men are frightened to go to the Leper Asylum. I can speak for myself; never till this moment have I been afraid to attend to cholera and small-pox cases. Is it possible for a responsible Medical Head to say that any doctors are afraid to meet it? That is what you said.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No, no.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—You did say something about the vaccinator.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You said that a compounder would not hold the abscess of a leper.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—You have pulled down the noble profession to an utter degradation by such allegations that medical men are afraid of attending cases.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—These are all unwarranted statements, Sir.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—You and I always make unwarranted statements in this House. You say that I always make unwarranted statements and I say that you always make unwarranted statements (*laughter*). You make such a lifeless statement. As a matter of fact, I brought this adjournment motion on the initiation of his own subordinates, so that they may not be charged with this heinous crime of cowardice. They wanted to make it clear. Now, Sir, another point I want this House to understand is there are only two points at issue—whether they are taken or not. I simply said that there must be a declaration whether any Head of a Department, however influential he may be for the time being, however powerful he may be for the time being, whether such a person shall be allowed to hand over Government institutions to private bodies, that is one question. The second is, I want to establish a convention in this House that no Government property shall be converted by a man because he claims that he has such a right over the public property. I cannot understand why we should not come

to a decision on these two points. These are too important, the Member for Trippunittura said in his first sentence. I opened this debate with the remark that, if it could be shown that it was in the interests of the lepers that such a change should be effected, I would be the first to support it. That question I never raised. That question we shall discuss later on.. The only question at issue is whether this high-handed act on the part of the Government in handing over institutions at the instance of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer is right.

As it was 5-30 p. m., the discussion automatically came to a close and the House rose for the day.

T. K. KRISHNA MENON,

Secretary to the Council.